

# *Transforming*

The Bible and the Lives  
of Transgender Christians

Austen Hartke

**WJK** WESTMINSTER  
JOHN KNOX PRESS  
LOUISVILLE • KENTUCKY

© 2018 Austen Hartke  
Foreword © 2018 Westminster John Knox Press

*First edition*  
Published by Westminster John Knox Press  
Louisville, Kentucky

18 19 20 21 22 23 24 25 26 27—10 9 8 7 6 5 4 3 2 1

*All rights reserved.* No part of this book may be reproduced or transmitted in any form or by any means, electronic or mechanical, including photocopying, recording, or by any information storage or retrieval system, without permission in writing from the publisher. For information, address Westminster John Knox Press, 100 Witherspoon Street, Louisville, Kentucky 40202-1396. Or contact us online at [www.wjkbooks.com](http://www.wjkbooks.com).

Unless otherwise indicated, Scripture quotations are from the New Revised Standard Version of the Bible, copyright © 1989 by the Division of Christian Education of the National Council of the Churches of Christ in the U.S.A., and are used by permission.

Scripture quotations marked NIV are from The Holy Bible, New International Version. Copyright © 1973, 1978, 1984, 2011 by Biblica, Inc.® Used by permission. All rights reserved worldwide.

*Book design by Drew Stevens*  
*Cover design by Nita Ybarra*

#### **Library of Congress Cataloging-in-Publication Data**

Names: Hartke, Austen, author.

Title: Transforming : the Bible and the lives of transgender Christians / Austen Hartke.

Description: Louisville, KY : Westminster John Knox Press, 2018. | Includes bibliographical references. |

Identifiers: LCCN 2017050167 (print) | LCCN 2017051728 (ebook) | ISBN 9781611648522 (ebk.) | ISBN 9780664263102 (pbk. : alk. paper)

Subjects: LCSH: Gender nonconformity—Religious aspects—Christianity. | Christian transgender people—Religious life.

Classification: LCC BR115.T76 (ebook) | LCC BR115.T76 H37 2018 (print) | DDC 277.3/0830867—dc23

LC record available at <https://lcn.loc.gov/2017050167>

∞ The paper used in this publication meets the minimum requirements of the American National Standard for Information Sciences—Permanence of Paper for Printed Library Materials, ANSI Z39.48-199.2.

Most Westminster John Knox Press books are available at special quantity discounts when purchased in bulk by corporations, organizations, and special-interest groups. For more information, please e-mail [SpecialSales@wjkbooks.com](mailto:SpecialSales@wjkbooks.com).

# *Contents*

Foreword by Matthew Vines	ix
Introduction: Did God Make a Mistake?	1
<b>Part One</b>	
1. Standing on the Edge	9
2. The Beginner's Guide to Gender	21
3. Sin, Sickness, or Specialty?	33
<b>Part Two</b>	
4. And God Said, Let There Be Marshes	47
5. Biblical Culture Shock	59
6. What's My Name Again?	75
7. God Breaks the Rules to Get You In	87
8. All the Best Disciples Are Eunuchs	101
9. Nothing Can Prevent Me	113
10. Even Jesus Had a Body	129
11. Life beyond Apologetics	143
12. Does Gender Matter Anymore?	155
Conclusion: The Trans-Affirming Toolbox	167
Acknowledgments	177
Notes	179
Further Reading	193

## *Foreword*

This book is a gift to the church, and it couldn't come at a more urgent time.

As more transgender people have come out in recent years, many cisgender people like me have begun to recognize the daunting scale of discrimination and hostility that trans people have to face every day. It's not overstating the matter to say that our society's mistreatment of transgender people is an ongoing humanitarian crisis.

According to the landmark National Transgender Discrimination Survey published in 2014, in the United States, 41 percent of transgender adults have attempted suicide. Just think about that: forty-one percent. (The overall rate for the general population is 1.6 percent.) But as horrifying as that statistic is, it's not surprising in light of these other numbers: 90 percent of transgender people have experienced harassment or discrimination at work, 57 percent have experienced significant family rejection, 26 percent have been fired for who they are, and 19 percent have experienced homelessness because of their gender identity. In recent years, too, the number of transgender people who have been murdered has gone up, and transgender women of color are usually the victims of these widely ignored attacks.

Where has the church been amidst this barrage of harassment, discrimination, and violence against transgender and gender-nonconforming people? All too often, the church has been part of the problem. For many transgender people, some of the most painful rejection they've experienced has been in church. After being mocked and bullied in school, they've been told by their pastors on Sunday that who they are at a fundamental level is a disgrace to God. Unless they can change

something that cannot be changed, transgender people are frequently told that there is no place for them among God's people, and a few verses from Scripture are casually deployed as tools of exclusion by those who've barely gotten to know the people they're excluding.

In the face of that kind of hostility, it would be perfectly defensible for transgender people to want nothing to do with Christianity—and indeed, if Jesus were here, I think he'd be turning over tables to protest the church's inhumane treatment of them. But that only makes the faith and testimonies of transgender Christians all the more powerful. I've met faithful transgender Christians all over the world, from Mississippi to Minnesota and as far away as Budapest. I've been inspired by their stories, and I've grown and changed as a result of them. I've also learned a great deal about theology and biblical interpretation from transgender Christians, and in this book you'll get to learn from one of the best teachers I know.

Austen Hartke is an ideal person to write this profoundly important book. I first got to know Austen a few years back through his wonderful YouTube series "Transgender and Christian," where he breaks down theological issues related to gender identity with grace, warmth, and expert skill. A graduate of Luther Seminary's Master of Arts program in Old Testament/Hebrew Bible Studies and the winner of the 2014 John Milton Prize in Old Testament Writing from Luther Seminary, Austen has a keen theological mind and an infectious love for Scripture. He's taught at The Reformation Project's conferences, and I've seen firsthand how his work has helped countless transgender people reconcile their faith and their gender identity.

But as powerful as Austen's own story is, he isn't just interested in letting you learn more about him. Austen has a huge heart for other transgender people, and in this book he shares with you the stories of other extraordinary transgender Christians, like the Reverend M Barclay, a nonbinary believer, and Nicole Garcia, a trans Latina minister. Austen is passionate about amplifying the voices of trans people of color, trans women, nonbinary people, and others who experience

multiple layers of marginalization in the church. That commitment shapes and enriches every page of his book.

I have a story to share about Austen that will show you some of his character and heart for others. When I was in Budapest recently, I spent an evening with about twenty LGBTQ Christians and allies. One young man who came that night had recently come out as transgender. He told me he'd found Austen's work online and that it had helped him in his journey as a transgender Christian. But even more than that, Austen had actually struck up a friendship with this man, answering his messages and going out of his way to provide encouragement and support to him from halfway across the world. This trans Christian expressed his amazement to me that Austen, an American with a growing platform and reputation, would take the time to befriend and support someone who was coming out as far away as Hungary. I was thrilled for him, but not surprised. That's just who Austen is.

It's out of that same servant's heart that Austen wrote this book. There is a desperate need for more pastoral and theological resources to help transgender and gender-nonconforming Christians, and through this book Austen is taking a significant step toward filling that need. He easily could have walked away from the church. He could have scorned those who haven't accepted him for who he is. But he didn't. He stayed out of his love for the church, and his writing and teaching are changing lives around the world. This book will only increase his impact, and it will be the first resource I recommend for transgender Christians and those seeking to love—and learn from—transgender and gender-nonconforming people in the church.

So pull up a chair and get started. This is a conversation that cannot wait, and Austen is the best of guides.

Matthew Vines

Founder and executive director of The Reformation Project,  
and author of *God and the Gay Christian:  
The Biblical Case in Support of Same-Sex Relationships*  
July 2, 2017

# *Introduction*

## Did God Make a Mistake?

Whenever I go to speak with Christians who are unfamiliar with transgender folks, it seems as if we spend the first few minutes dancing around the question they really want to ask. Not “Have you had the surgery?” or “What’s your real name?” (Though I’ve heard those too, and I always take a moment to remind people that those questions aren’t appropriate or a good way to start a conversation.) No, the question I get most often sounds more like this: “So, if God made you female, but you identify as male, does that mean that you think God made a mistake?”

I asked myself that same question for a long time before coming out as transgender. As a teenager I believed strongly in the idea that everything happens for a reason, and if that was true, then there must have been a reason God had made me with a body that was designated female when I was born. Even though I’d known for most of my life that I didn’t feel like a girl, I did my best to ignore that fact and push it down deep where I didn’t have to think about it. The biggest hurdle I faced in addressing my gender identity was that it seemed like saying God was wrong.

So imagine my relief when I started coming across Scripture passages that appeared to have something to say about gender identity and the way God made the world! In seminary I read the Bible cover to cover and spent hours in the library poring over books about creation narratives, clothing in the ancient world, and the meaning of the incarnation. I learned from Job that sometimes things happen in the world that don't make much sense to us human beings. I learned from Abraham what it's like to have your name changed. I learned from the apostle Philip that sometimes you have to say yes to God even when you have no idea what God is doing. And of course I learned from Jesus, who after his resurrection chose to show his body to the disciples—a body that was scarred and transformed, and yet still his own.

The more I learned, the more I felt compelled to open up myself to the world. I wanted to take out the parts of myself that I'd packed away out of sight, and to let them breathe in the sunshine. It almost felt as if my heart was trying to escape my chest, pulling in the same sort of way it had when I began considering a seminary education. I decided to follow that call, and when I started talking with other transgender people and describing my experiences, I heard them speaking parts of my own story back to me. When I discovered that there were other transgender Christians (who knew?!), I felt as if I'd stumbled across buried treasure.

Before long, I was finding my own answer to that original question: "Did God make a mistake?" Personally, my answer is no. I don't believe God made a mistake in creating me just as I am. God created me with a body that was designated female when I was born—a body that I struggled to connect with for the first twenty-six years of my life and that I now finally feel at home in—but God also created me with a capacity for change and with a mind that identifies as male. I believe God made all of me—gender identity included—and intended for me to be a transgender person who sees the world through a different lens. I don't think God made a mistake. I think God made me transgender on purpose.



After I graduated from seminary I wasn't sure what to do next. I really wanted to keep talking with other trans Christians and to keep exploring the Scripture passages that had given me so much life! I began making videos about gender-related theological topics and posting them on YouTube, and before long people started leaving comments. Some were wonderful, and some were mean-spirited, but the ones that got to me the most came from transgender teenagers and young people who had desperate questions. Questions like, "Does God still love me if I'm trans?" and "My pastor says I'm going to hell. What do I do?" I did my best to point toward helpful resources (many of which you'll find in the Further Reading section in the back of this book), but in the end I couldn't find a written, accessible place where all kinds of different trans-affirming theologies came together. I wanted a book written by transgender people and for transgender people and the faith communities that care about them.

That's why I began talking with friends of mine who also identified as transgender Christians, asking them if they'd be willing to share some of the things they've learned. I certainly don't have all the answers! As a white, bisexual, transgender man, I have no idea what it's like to navigate Christian faith as a person of color, or as a nonbinary person, or as a trans woman. I wanted to include some stories that end happily—and some others that don't end on such an upbeat note. Trans Christians face incredible obstacles in churches around the world. While some of us find ways to make it back into affirming communities with a faith that's still strong, not all of us have found that fountain of healing yet.

I'm so thankful to the people who agreed to sit down and gift me with their time and their knowledge, as this project was coming together. When I talked with the people you're about to meet in these pages, I always ended each interview with the same big question: "Do you think God made a mistake?" Strangely enough, even though we're all very different, we seem to agree on this subject.

Here are a few of their answers:

If there's a mistake at all, it's that we've created this understanding of gender that is so deeply limiting of God's creation. That's the mistake. We've always been diverse people. We've always recognized that using tools, for lack of a better word, to best support our bodies is a good thing. Certainly those of us who change our bodies physically because of our gender identity are not the first people in the world who have needed assistance to be our best selves.

—M

God created us with the ability to also be creators, and some of those creators created surgical procedures and medical procedures and concepts and ideologies and systems and communities that do wonderful things! If we aren't taking part in that creative process, then we're going against our very created nature.

—Lawrence

God doesn't make mistakes; she just makes things easier or a bit more difficult to find. Transitioning doesn't mean that God made a mistake, just that I need to work a bit harder to find the fullness of life God has for me.

—River

I think that God knit me together in my mother's womb, but has also been knitting me together every day since. I think God knit together my body and my identity. I'm not just a woman. I'm not just a man. I'm transgender. That's what God intended.

—Asher

I can't wait for you to read more about each of these wonderful people in the coming chapters, and to get a glimpse inside their faith and their lives. One quick note before we get going: In this book I use the word "queer" as a synonym for people with LGBTQ+ identities. Not every gay, lesbian, bisexual,

or transgender person uses this word to describe themselves, because even though it's in the process of being reclaimed by LGBTQ+ activists, historically it has been used as a slur. In the interviews in this book I use the word "queer" only to describe someone who has already affirmed that they use this word for themselves. If you are unsure whether it's right to use a word to describe a person's identity, it's always best to ask first!

So, let's wade a little deeper into these theological waters. Christians these days have questions about what the Bible has to say regarding clothing, changing bodies, new names, and the way God created human beings to exist in this world. I am thankful that trans Christians, who have been living and studying these questions for years, have come up with some pretty fascinating answers! Let's begin by asking ourselves why theology for and about transgender people is important.

## PART ONE

# 1

## *Standing on the Edge*

“Do they even let . . . people like you . . . in?”

This was the first thing my sister Madelyn asked when I told her that I was applying to seminary. Of course, she didn’t mean it in a derogatory way—she was and continues to be one of the most supportive people in my life—but she was curious and concerned. In 2011, when I submitted my application to a degree program in youth ministry, I had not yet come to grips with my gender identity. I had been open about my bisexuality for about seven years, though, and I didn’t relish the idea of having to get back into the closet.

This meant that when I started considering a seminary program, my discernment process didn’t begin with “Is God leading me toward ministry?” or even “Would this degree give me a leg up in my career?” No, when I arrived on campus for visit days, I was seeking some more basic answers. For instance, if I brought my whole self to the study of Scripture and the building up of the church, would I be welcomed? If I opened myself to honest and authentic communion with others in the classroom and in the sanctuary, could I count on being physically safe?

Most Christians in the United States today don't have to choose between being open about their relationships or being excommunicated. Most Christians don't have to risk being assaulted on their way to services for wearing their favorite dress, only to arrive and hear a sermon condemning them to eternal punishment. But some do.

That is why, to this day, I feel just a little bit nervous when I walk into any unfamiliar church building. It's a response reinforced by years of necessary self-defense, which too many LGBTQ+ Christians have to cultivate. The landmark 2013 Pew Research Center Survey of LGBT Americans tells us that 29 percent of LGBT-identified folks have been made to feel unwelcome in religious spaces.<sup>1</sup> When we consider the fact that the Williams Institute estimated the number of LGBTQ+ Americans to be about nine million in 2011,<sup>2</sup> this means that roughly two and a half million people have been treated poorly by those who share their faith, simply because of their sexuality or gender identity.

That negative treatment—whether it manifests itself as hostile stares, a direct order to leave, or physical violence—doesn't exist in a vacuum. As Christianity continues to be the dominant religious force behind much of American culture, people outside church walls have begun to express frustration with the faith's attitude toward LGBTQ+ people. A 2014 study revealed that 70 percent of millennials and 58 percent of Americans overall now believe that religious groups are alienating people by being too judgmental about LGBTQ+ issues like same-sex marriage.<sup>3</sup> One-quarter of the people who were raised in religious families, but have left their tradition, admit that negative treatment or teachings about LGBTQ+ people was a factor in their decision to leave. With organized Christianity in America already facing a steady decline,<sup>4</sup> we might well ask how the church could possibly afford to push anyone out, especially persons who desperately seek to be recognized and accepted as part of the faith.

And that's the strangest part about these recent studies: despite Christianity's reputation for anti-LGBTQ+ sentiment,

half of queer-identified adults claim a religious affiliation, and 17 percent consider their faith very important in their lives.<sup>5</sup> What's more, these percentages appear to be getting larger every year.<sup>6</sup>

How does it feel to be caught in the crosshairs between your faith and your identity, which has been declared part of “the culture wars”? For some LGBTQ+ Christians, it's a refining fire that brings about an even greater passion for mercy, justice, and a relationship with God. Gay and lesbian Christians like Matthew Vines and Rachel Murr have even written about their experiences and their journey to a greater understanding of the “clobber passages” related to sexuality. In recent years, cultural and political issues like same-sex marriage have brought lesbian, gay, and bisexual issues into the cultural limelight.

Transgender issues and identities, however, have been largely ignored during this same time period, both within society at large and more obviously within Christian circles. The writers at *Christianity Today*, an evangelical magazine, expressed low-level apprehensions about trans issues beginning in 2008, but it wasn't until 2012 that the T in LGBT found its first big Christian news headline. A Girl Scout troop in Colorado allowed a young transgender woman to join; this prompted swift retribution, in the form of a cookie boycott by some Christians. In 2013, Dr. Heath Adam Ackley, a professor at the evangelical Azusa Pacific University, came out as transgender and was subsequently asked to leave. In May 2014, *Time* magazine declared the year “the transgender tipping point” and predicted that trans issues would be “America's next civil-rights frontier.” This was followed by the introduction of a record number of trans-exclusionary bills in state legislatures in 2015.

While transgender visibility has increased in the past five years (the number of people who personally know a trans person has doubled from 17 percent of Americans in 2014 to 35 percent just two years later),<sup>7</sup> visibility itself has not always had a positive effect. As more trans people come forward and share their stories and the struggles that they face, those who find trans identities distasteful or morally corrupt feel that they must

also come forward with their own opinions, policies, and theological pronouncements. In October 2015, just three months after Olympic superstar Caitlyn Jenner came out as transgender on the cover of *Vanity Fair* magazine, the Association of Certified Biblical Counselors (ACBC) put together an event that they billed as “evangelical Christians’ first-ever conference on transgender issues.”<sup>8</sup> No transgender people were asked to speak at this event. Instead, the largely Southern Baptist-identified speakers agreed beforehand to a statement that rejected the idea that “a human being could possess a gender other than the one indicated by biological sex.” Members of the ACBC argued that gender dysphoria is a result of original sin, and Owen Strachan, the executive director of the Council on Biblical Manhood and Womanhood, declared, “Even if we have never intended to choose a transgender identity, if we embrace this impulse, we are following, chasing a sinful instinct. We are in fact sinning against God.”<sup>9</sup>

Then, in 2016, what had previously been a predominantly theological debate, between conservative Christians and those who supported transgender justice, became an all-out battle that exploded onto the national legislative scene. On May 13, the US Justice Department and the US Department of Education sent out a joint guidance letter to all public schools, clarifying that Title IX protections against discrimination based on sex now functionally included discrimination based on gender identity. The letter stated that, in order to be in compliance with Title IX, public schools must not discriminate based on gender identity when it comes to gender-segregated spaces like restrooms, locker rooms, single-sex classes or schools, fraternities, or sororities. All schools that wished to continue receiving federal monies must be in compliance with Title IX.<sup>10</sup>

Suddenly the movement toward protection for transgender people in the United States became, in the opinion of some Christians, a threat to religious liberty. Dozens of schools began the process of requesting religious exemption waivers so that they would not have to comply with the clarified ruling<sup>11</sup>—a move reminiscent of the religious exemption



from providing birth control won by Hobby Lobby in 2014 and the exemption from service to same-gender couples requested by a bakery in Colorado in 2013.

But these individual corporations, small businesses, and schools were not working alone. Three powerhouses of conservative Christian social action—the Alliance Defending Freedom, the Family Research Council, and Focus on the Family—have been instrumental in providing funding and legal counsel in support of what they consider to be religious freedom. When it comes to transgender issues specifically, each of these three organizations has had a hand in stirring the pot.

While it claims not to lobby government officials or promote legislation, the Alliance Defending Freedom—whose mission statement is “To keep the doors open for the Gospel by advocating for religious liberty, the sanctity of life, and marriage and family”—has created a policy template barring transgender students from school bathrooms and has offered to defend any school district that implements such a policy.<sup>12</sup> This “Student Physical Privacy Act” was then used as a model upon which several state legislatures built proposals banning transgender people from the public bathrooms that aligned with their gender identity.<sup>13</sup>

The Family Research Council, a public-policy organization whose mission is to “advance faith, family and freedom in public policy and the culture from a Christian worldview,” has also been instrumental in influencing legislative efforts against transgender Americans. Their political action committee, the Faith Family Freedom Fund, ran advertising campaigns against Houston’s proposed Equal Rights Ordinance in 2015, claiming that if the nondiscrimination measure passed, Houstonians could be fined for blocking a man from entering a women’s bathroom. Peter Sprigg of the Family Research Council argued that including gender identity as a protected category in civil rights laws would “threaten the public safety of women and children by creating the legitimized access that sexual predators tend to seek.”<sup>14</sup>

This has not proven to be the case. In the twelve states that had included gender identity in their nondiscrimination laws

as of March 2014, no one had assaulted anyone else through access gained to these spaces as a result of this type of policy.<sup>15</sup> Moreover, the same study done on nondiscrimination laws showed that there had never been an incident where a transgender person harassed or attacked anyone in a gendered facility, debunking the idea that transgender people are a danger to others. In fact, according to a 2013 study conducted by the Williams Institute, 70 percent of transgender people have themselves at some point been the victim of either verbal or physical assault in gendered restrooms.<sup>16</sup>

Focus on the Family is arguably the most well-known Christian ministry organization in the United States. In 2015 they updated a position statement on their website to contain an entire series on transgender issues, which included the assertion that transgender identities “violate God’s intentional design for sex and sexuality.” The statement continues,

We believe that this is a cultural and theological challenge that we must engage and win. The modern “transgender” movement is systematically working to dismantle the reality of two sexes—male and female—as the Bible and the world have always known this to be. If the transgender lobby succeeds, there will be striking consequences for individuals, marriage, family and society at large.<sup>17</sup>

In this spirit of engaging to win, Focus on the Family’s policy division, the Family Policy Alliance (formerly known as Citizen-Link), helped implement House Bill 2 in North Carolina in 2016. This bill was the first piece of state legislation signed into law that specifically required transgender people to use the bathroom or other gendered facility that corresponded with the gender marker on their birth certificate, and blocked any non-discrimination policy that included gender identity or sexual orientation from becoming law anywhere within the state.

These two stipulations may seem inconsequential to those who don’t identify as transgender, but the stress caused by the realization that you might be arrested for entering one bathroom and harassed or attacked if you enter the other can hardly

be overstated. In an interview with Greta Gustava Martela, one of the founders of the transgender crisis hotline Trans Lifeline, it was discovered that incoming calls to the crisis center doubled in the three weeks after HB2 was signed into law.<sup>18</sup> This law, which was later found by the US Justice Department to violate the Federal Civil Rights Act, was put in place through the direct efforts of Focus on the Family and the Family Policy Alliance. According to the most recently released IRS documentation, the FPA contributed over a third of the operating budget for their affiliate, the North Carolina Family Policy Council.<sup>19</sup> The NCFPC, in turn, pressed North Carolina governor Pat McCrory to call a special session,<sup>20</sup> which passed HB2 through the entire state legislative process in one day.

Many other Christian denominations hold similarly negative views when it comes to transgender identities, though the actions they take may not be as recognizably detrimental. Some take a more moderate stance or promote a form of conditional acceptance. The Southern Baptist Convention passed a resolution in 2014 that declares “gender identity confusion” to be the effect of a fallen human nature, and something that must not be encouraged or normalized. Toward the end of the same document it is resolved that the Convention “love our transgender neighbors, seek their good always, welcome them to our churches and, as they repent and believe in Christ, receive them into church membership.”<sup>21</sup> Though the statement calls for a loving response, the emphasis is placed on a required repentance, which presupposes three things: that transgender identities are themselves sinful, that a trans person can reject their identity if they try hard enough, and that trans identities are incompatible with faith in Christ.

Other Christian groups, like the Lutheran Church–Missouri Synod (LCMS), have focused not so much on transgender identities as on a person’s physical transition. The LCMS Commission on Theology and Church Relations released a statement in 2014 that advises pastors to discourage any form of transition for transgender congregants, and instead suggests that pastors refer trans people to a Christian therapist.<sup>22</sup> In the

same year, the Assemblies of God churches adopted a statement “discouraging any and all attempts to physically change, alter, or disagree with [a person’s] predominant biological sex—including but not limited to elective sex-reassignment, transvestite, transgender, or nonbinary ‘genderqueer’ acts or conduct.”<sup>23</sup> While these statements do not give much direction on how to treat a transgender person who has already transitioned, they create an environment that would give any current member some significant second thoughts before coming out.

The extent to which a transgender member might be allowed to be involved in the life of the church has also been a point of dissention for many Christians. Some denominations welcome transgender people looking for a church home but deny them official membership. Others allow membership but won’t elect a trans person into any leadership position. The Roman Catholic Church made the news in 2015 after the Vatican’s policy-enforcing arm, the Congregation for the Doctrine of the Faith, determined that transgender people are not eligible to become godparents. After Alex Salinas requested to become his nephew’s godfather, the church stated that being openly transgender “reveals in a public way an attitude opposite to the moral imperative of solving the problem of sexual identity according to the truth of one’s own sexuality.”<sup>24</sup> The statement went on to say that Salinas was not fit to become a godparent because “it is evident that this person does not possess the requirement of leading a life according to the faith and in the position of godfather.”

This was a blow to Catholics who had hoped that the church under Pope Francis’s leadership would be a more welcoming place for LGBTQ+ Christians. Francis himself faced criticism for what many saw as a comparison between transgender people and nuclear weapons during an interview with authors Andrea Torielli and Giacomo Galeazzi in their book *This Economy Kills: Pope Francis on Capitalism and Social Justice*. During a part of the interview in which he talks about things that destroy the order of creation, Francis uses the following examples: “Let’s think of the nuclear arms, of the possibility

to annihilate in a few instants a very high number of human beings. Let's think also of genetic manipulation, of the manipulation of life, or of the gender theory, that does not recognize the order of creation."<sup>25</sup> The phrase "gender theory," while having many possible meanings, usually encompasses the ways sociologists have come to understand the human experience in terms of spectrums of sex, gender, and gender expression. Francis appears to be articulating his opinion that these ranges of human experience are outside God's created order and may even be dangerous.

What effect must it have on young transgender Catholics to know that their church community considers them unnatural and dangerous? What does a transgender member of an Assemblies of God church do when they're told transitioning is not an option? When James Dobson, the founder of Focus on the Family, goes on record encouraging men to "defend your wife's privacy and security in restroom facilities" against "a strange-looking man, dressed like a woman," and lamenting the fact that it's no longer acceptable to shoot the transgender person in this situation, what effect does this have on our country?<sup>26</sup>

The year 2016 was the deadliest on record for transgender people in the United States.<sup>27</sup> Twenty-seven transgender people were murdered that year, compared to the twenty-one people we lost in 2015, and the thirteen killed in 2014—and these are just the murders that we know about.<sup>28</sup> Oftentimes transgender people are misgendered by law enforcement and news agencies after their death; as a result, their true identities and their stories are lost to us. Additionally, it's crucial to note that the majority of transgender homicide victims are women of color—specifically, Black trans women—who must deal with the triple threat of sexism, racism, and transphobia. With at least twenty-one murders of transgender people counted in our country within the first ten months of the year, 2017 may set an abhorrent new high.

The Human Rights Campaign put forward a report in 2011 that attempted to understand the reasons behind the current murder epidemic. They found that, when all other factors were

accounted for, transgender people were disproportionately affected by homelessness, poverty, job discrimination, bullying in school, and harassment by law enforcement.<sup>29</sup> Essentially, the mental and emotional bias that American culture holds against transgender individuals leaks out into real-world actions against trans people, whether that action is turning down a nonbinary applicant for a job or gunning down a trans woman in a bathroom.

When our churches support or even organically formulate the idea that transgender people are morally, intellectually, or theologically inferior, we feed right into the hatred that leads to death for an already marginalized group. The HRC's report found that 41 percent of trans individuals have attempted suicide, compared to 1.6 percent of the general population of the United States. Nearly half of trans folks attempt suicide, not because there's something inherently wrong with them, but because they experience a phenomenon called "minority stress."<sup>30</sup> Minority stress describes the friction that occurs between a person who holds a marginalized identity and the hostile environment in which they live. Transgender people live with a continuous expectation of rejection, and many experience an endless underlying current of fear because of the threat of physical or emotional violence. This constant stress can lead to depression, anxiety, substance-abuse disorders, and suicidal thoughts and actions. A study coordinated by the Williams Institute and the American Foundation for Suicide Prevention found direct evidence of minority stress when they discovered that suicide rates among transgender and gender-nonconforming adults jumped from the base 41 percent to 59 percent among those who were harassed at work, 61 percent among those who were harassed by law-enforcement officers, and 78 percent among those who experienced physical or sexual violence.<sup>31</sup>

The strain on transgender people has increased with the advent of bathroom bills and the legislation of gendered spaces. Williams Institute manager of transgender research Jody L. Herman confirmed that experiences in gendered restrooms

are significantly affecting levels of minority stress. She states unequivocally that “policies to protect transgender people’s access to restrooms can be understood as policies that are connected to the health and well-being of transgender people.”<sup>32</sup>

Living every hour of your life with your guard up can take its toll on anyone, but for LGBTQ+ and transgender people, the stress can be deadly. Yet Christian churches and organizations continue to advocate and fund policies that make this state of being inescapable.

If the high rates of suicide and murder for transgender people can be traced to legitimate fears of harassment, discrimination, and rejection, then the obvious solution is to create an environment in which the injured, the worn-out, and the hopeless feel safe and loved. In fact, the number one predictor of health and well-being in LGBTQ+ youth is family acceptance and the creation of a safe haven at home.<sup>33</sup> Over half of the LGBTQ+ young people who were rejected by their families reported having attempted suicide, compared to only 32 percent of those who had supportive families. Family acceptance is also a protection against depression, substance abuse, and other negative mental health issues that are usually seen in those who experience minority stress.

The problem is that family acceptance itself is intricately tied to religious affiliation. Many parents who try to follow their faith and do what’s best for their child’s soul may end up doing irreversible harm to their child’s physical and mental health. As Caitlin Ryan, director of the Family Acceptance Project, put it, “Most families, including very religious families, are shocked to learn that behaviors they engage in to try to help their LGBT children fit in and be accepted by others instead contribute to serious health risks, such as suicide attempts.”<sup>34</sup> What the Family Acceptance Project and others have found is that high religiosity in families is directly connected to high levels of family rejection.

When parents attend churches that teach that being transgender is sinful, they are much more likely to reject their child, once that child comes out; in turn, a child who is rejected is

more likely to suffer from mental health issues and to commit suicide. This sad fact was made visible for many in the death of Leelah Alcorn, who stepped out in front of a truck in December 2014 after experiencing negative faith-based reactions from her parents and being forced to attend Christian conversion therapy to “cure” her of her gender identity.

Christianity has been dominated by the voices of those who speak out against the existence, the well-being, and the humanity of transgender people. These voices have sunk into the fabric of American culture, and the result has been a rash of murders that causes no religious outrage, no demand for justice from those who should have cared for the wounded ones on the side of the road. We have closed our ears to the cry of the parents who have lost their children because of toxic theology; we have turned away from the tears of the youth who ask if Jesus can love them just as they are. Too many of those questioning their gender identity have been made to feel that they must choose between God and an authentic and healthy life. Not all of the people forced into that decision make it out alive.

This is where transgender Christians have been forced to live: out on the edges. They walk the fine line between acceptance and rejection, between God’s love and the church’s judgment.

But this is also where God begins to bring life out of death, because although religious affiliation in families has been connected to rejection of LGBT children, faith can also be one of the largest contributors to well-being in youth if their religious community supports them.<sup>35</sup> We know that family acceptance and the creation of a refuge in homes and communities is incredibly important to the health of transgender people, and so we must ask, is it time for God’s house to truly become a house of prayer for all people? Will we hear the words of Scripture, and the stories of the trans Christians in our midst, and allow our sanctuaries to become the spaces they were always meant to be?